

Message

---

**From:** Sinks, Tom [Sinks.Tom@epa.gov]  
**Sent:** 12/14/2017 2:40:58 PM  
**To:** Beck, Nancy [Beck.Nancy@epa.gov]; Bertrand, Charlotte [Bertrand.Charlotte@epa.gov]; Raffaele, Kathleen [raffaele.kathleen@epa.gov]; Grevatt, Peter [Grevatt.Peter@epa.gov]; Orme-Zavaleta, Jennifer [Orme-Zavaleta.Jennifer@epa.gov]  
**Subject:** FW: ATSDR Draft PFAS Tox Profile  
  
**Flag:** Flag for follow up

FYI

---

**From:** Sinks, Tom  
**Sent:** Thursday, December 14, 2017 9:40 AM  
**To:** Breyse, Patrick N. (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH) <pjb7@cdc.gov>  
**Cc:** Decker, John A. (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH) <jad4@cdc.gov>; Sinks, Tom <Sinks.Tom@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: ATSDR Draft PFAS Tox Profile

Let's go ahead and set up an hour next week if that works for you. Send me some possible times so I can vet them with attendees here. We can sort out the agenda once we agree on a time slot.

---

**From:** Sinks, Tom  
**Sent:** Tuesday, December 12, 2017 11:01 AM  
**To:** Breyse, Patrick N. (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH) <pjb7@cdc.gov>  
**Cc:** Decker, John A. (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH) <jad4@cdc.gov>; Sinks, Tom <Sinks.Tom@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: ATSDR Draft PFAS Tox Profile

Thanks Pat. Maybe we can simplify this. Two EPA concerns are: 1) the comments from the Office of Water italicized below in Jennifer's email (in yellow) and 2) the use of an uncertainty factor of 10x for immune-toxicity rather than using an immune-toxicity study as the point of departure without the uncertainty factor. EPA provided ATSDR with comments from our scientists on 6/19, 6/20, and 6/21. We'd like to know how they have been incorporated into the revised draft. If ATSDR provided us with a written response to our comments it should save significant time. I assume the Division has provided you and John D a set of written responses to our comments for your internal clearance and those should be easy to provide.

---

**From:** Breyse, Patrick N. (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH) [mailto:pjb7@cdc.gov]  
**Sent:** Monday, December 11, 2017 4:31 PM  
**To:** Sinks, Tom <Sinks.Tom@epa.gov>  
**Cc:** Decker, John A. (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH) <jad4@cdc.gov>  
**Subject:** RE: ATSDR Draft PFAS Tox Profile

Tom - thanks for getting back. I think 1 hour should be fine. We are interested in hearing about your concerns during the call. We'd be happy to review our methods if that would be helpful.

Pat

---

**From:** Sinks, Tom [mailto:Sinks.Tom@epa.gov]  
**Sent:** Thursday, December 7, 2017 8:30 AM  
**To:** Carroll, Yulia (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH) <eya3@cdc.gov>; Breyse, Patrick N. (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH) <pjb7@cdc.gov>

**Cc:** Decker, John A. (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH) <[jad4@cdc.gov](mailto:jad4@cdc.gov)>; Jones, Vivian K. (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH) (CTR) <[buo1@cdc.gov](mailto:buo1@cdc.gov)>; Sinks, Tom <[Sinks.Tom@epa.gov](mailto:Sinks.Tom@epa.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: ATSDR Draft PFAS Tox Profile

Thanks for contacting me Yulia. Hope all is well. It is too late for me to coordinate this for Monday or Tuesday next week. Scientists from ORD and our programs (OCSSP/OPPT, OW, and OLEM) will want to be on the call. I suggest we block out 2 hours the week of the 17<sup>th</sup>. Send me some blocks of time and I will work from that. It would be great to do this by video conference.

My suggestion for the agenda would be to cover ...

Introductions

Summary ATSDR methods used to derive the MRL

Response to EPA scientists' comments

Questions to, and comments from, peer reviewers

Comments and response to other agencies

ATSDR guidance to health assessors using the MRLs in finished drinking water versus the EPA Health Advisory.

---

**From:** Carroll, Yulia (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH) [<mailto:eva3@cdc.gov>]

**Sent:** Wednesday, December 06, 2017 4:53 PM

**To:** Breysse, Patrick N. (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH) <[pjb7@cdc.gov](mailto:pjb7@cdc.gov)>; Sinks, Tom <[Sinks.Tom@epa.gov](mailto:Sinks.Tom@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Decker, John A. (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH) <[jad4@cdc.gov](mailto:jad4@cdc.gov)>; Jones, Vivian K. (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH) (CTR) <[buo1@cdc.gov](mailto:buo1@cdc.gov)>

**Subject:** RE: ATSDR Draft PFAS Tox Profile

Hi Tom,

Hope you are doing well! We are available next Monday and Tuesday (December 11 and 12), at 4:15 pm. If this time doesn't work for you, what days/ times are good for the week of December 17<sup>th</sup>? Also, do you have an agenda for the meeting?

Thank you and looking forward to talking to you again!

Yulia

*Yulia Iossifova Carroll, MD, PhD*

*Office of Science, NCEH/ATSDR*

---

**From:** Breysse, Patrick N. (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH)

**Sent:** Tuesday, December 5, 2017 11:29 AM

**To:** 'sinks.tom@epa.gov' <[sinks.tom@epa.gov](mailto:sinks.tom@epa.gov)>

**Cc:** Decker, John A. (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH) <[jad4@cdc.gov](mailto:jad4@cdc.gov)>; Carroll, Yulia (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH) <[eva3@cdc.gov](mailto:eva3@cdc.gov)>; Jones, Vivian K. (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH) (CTR) <[buo1@cdc.gov](mailto:buo1@cdc.gov)>

**Subject:** FW: ATSDR Draft PFAS Tox Profile

Tom: Not sure if we have ever met - regardless I look forward to having meeting to discuss our upcoming PFAS Profile. I will ask my Office of Science to coordinate from our end. You should be hearing from them shortly.

Pat

---

**From:** Orme-Zavaleta, Jennifer [<mailto:Orme-Zavaleta.Jennifer@epa.gov>]

**Sent:** Tuesday, November 28, 2017 8:57 AM

To: Breyse, Patrick N. (CDC/ONDIEH/NCEH) <[pjb7@cdc.gov](mailto:pjb7@cdc.gov)>

Cc: Ikeda, Robin (CDC/ONDIEH/OD) <[rmi0@cdc.gov](mailto:rmi0@cdc.gov)>; Drinkard, Andrea <[Drinkard.Andrea@epa.gov](mailto:Drinkard.Andrea@epa.gov)>; Beck, Nancy <[Beck.Nancy@epa.gov](mailto:Beck.Nancy@epa.gov)>; Grevatt, Peter <[Grevatt.Peter@epa.gov](mailto:Grevatt.Peter@epa.gov)>; Raffaele, Kathleen <[raffaele.kathleen@epa.gov](mailto:raffaele.kathleen@epa.gov)>; Flowers, Lynn <[Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov](mailto:Flowers.Lynn@epa.gov)>; Rodan, Bruce <[rodan.bruce@epa.gov](mailto:rodan.bruce@epa.gov)>; Yamada, Richard (Yujiro) <[yamada.richard@epa.gov](mailto:yamada.richard@epa.gov)>; Hubbard, Carolyn <[Hubbard.Carolyn@epa.gov](mailto:Hubbard.Carolyn@epa.gov)>; Orme-Zavaleta, Jennifer <[Orme-Zavaleta.Jennifer@epa.gov](mailto:Orme-Zavaleta.Jennifer@epa.gov)>

Subject: ATSDR Draft PFAS Tox Profile

Dear Pat,

I want to thank you for the 11/13/2017 email from Henry Abadin and Janine Cory requesting EPA begin cross-Agency coordination with ATSDR on communications related to the pending release of your draft PFAS Toxicologic Profile for public comment. While coordination on communications is important, EPA believes it essential that ATSDR and EPA discuss the science underlying your draft document prior to coordinating communications related to the release.

I ask that you not release your draft document until EPA and ATSDR scientists have had the opportunity to meet and discuss the science and recommend next steps to their respective leadership. Coordination of communications should follow such a discussion. Ideally this will result in a harmonized approach that provides the public a clear and consistent message regarding the safety of drinking water contaminated with these compounds, regardless of its source.

EPA scientists can be available to meet as soon as next week. To coordinate a meeting please contact Tom Sinks in EPA's Office of the Science Advisor ([sinks.tom@epa.gov](mailto:sinks.tom@epa.gov) 202 564-3099).

#### **Background**

In May, 2016 EPA issued a Health Advisory for PFOA and PFOS concentrations in drinking water. On May 31, 2017 we received a preliminary draft ATSDR Toxicologic profile for 14 PFAS chemicals - 12 monitored by NCEH in NHANES and two other compounds monitored elsewhere. Draft ATSDR Minimal Risk Levels (MRLs) were provided for PFOA (oral intermediate value), PFOS (oral intermediate value), PFHxSa (oral intermediate value), and PFNA (oral intermediate value). An EPA scientist (Bob Benson) participated in the ATSDR MRL working group on 6/22/2017. EPA provided comments from our scientists to ATSDR during June 2017.

Deliberative Process / Ex. 5

## **Deliberative Process / Ex. 5**

We understand that a letter peer review was conducted by ATSDR, but EPA has not seen the questions provided to the peer reviewers, and we have not seen any response to EPA comments or those of the Peer Reviewers who examined the draft PFAS Toxicologic Profile. This information will provide an initial basis for a scientist-to-scientist meeting with ATSDR on PFAS toxicity.

Thank you for your attention to this matter. As always, we appreciate our excellent working relationship with CDC and ATSDR as we both strive to protect the public from environmental health issues.

jennifer

Jennifer Orme-Zavaleta, PhD  
Principal Deputy Assistant Administrator for Science  
USEPA Office of Research and Development

DC: 202-564-6620

RTP: 919-541-2283

919-699-1564 (cell)

[orme-zavaleta.jennifer@epa.gov](mailto:orme-zavaleta.jennifer@epa.gov)